SAW-56 ASSESSMENT SUMMARY REPORT

Introduction

The 56th SAW Assessment Summary Report contains summary and detailed technical information on two stock assessments reviewed during February 19-22, 2013 at the Stock Assessment Workshop (SAW) by the 56th Stock Assessment Review Committee (SARC-56): Atlantic surfclam (Spisula solidissima) and white hake (Urophycis tenuis). The SARC-56 consisted of 3 external, independent reviewers appointed by the Center for Independent Experts [CIE], and an external SARC chairman from the MAFMC SSC. The SARC evaluated whether each Term of Reference (listed in the Appendix) was completed successfully based on whether the work provided a scientifically credible basis for developing fishery management advice. The reviewers’ reports for SAW/SARC-56 are available at website: http://www.nefsc.noaa.gov/nefsc/saw/ under the heading “SARC 56 Panelist Reports”.

An important aspect of any assessment is the determination of current stock status. The status of the stock relates to both the rate of removal of fish from the population – the exploitation rate – and the current stock size. The exploitation rate is the proportion of the stock alive at the beginning of the year that is caught during the year. When that proportion exceeds the amount specified in an overfishing definition, overfishing is occurring. Fishery removal rates are usually expressed in terms of the instantaneous fishing mortality rate, F, and the maximum removal rate is denoted as F_{THRESHOLD}.

Another important factor for classifying the status of a resource is the current stock level, for example, spawning stock biomass (SSB) or total stock biomass (TSB). Overfishing definitions, therefore, characteristically include specification of a minimum biomass threshold as well as a maximum fishing threshold. If the biomass of a stock falls below the biomass threshold (B_{THRESHOLD}) the stock is in an overfished condition. The Sustainable Fisheries Act mandates that a stock rebuilding plan be developed should this situation arise.

As there are two dimensions to stock status – the rate of removal and the biomass level – it is possible that a stock not currently subject to overfishing in terms of exploitation rates is in an overfished condition, that is, has a biomass level less than the threshold level. This may be due to heavy exploitation in the past, or a result of other factors such as unfavorable environmental conditions. In this case, future recruitment to the stock is very important and the probability of improvement may increase greatly by increasing the stock size. Conversely, fishing down a stock that is at a high biomass level should generally increase the long-term sustainable yield. Stocks under federal jurisdiction are managed on the basis of maximum sustainable yield (MSY). The biomass that produces this yield is called B_{MSY} and the fishing mortality rate that produces MSY is called F_{MSY}.

Given this, federally managed stocks under review are classified with respect to current overfishing definitions. A stock is overfished if its current biomass is below B_{THRESHOLD} and overfishing is occurring if current F is greater than F_{THRESHOLD}. The table below depicts status criteria.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXPLOITATION RATE</th>
<th>( B &lt; B_{\text{THRESHOLD}} )</th>
<th>( B_{\text{THRESHOLD}} &lt; B &lt; B_{\text{MSY}} )</th>
<th>( B &gt; B_{\text{MSY}} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( F &gt; F_{\text{THRESHOLD}} )</td>
<td>Overfished, overfishing is occurring; reduce ( F ), adopt and follow rebuilding plan</td>
<td>Not overfished, overfishing is occurring; reduce ( F ), rebuild stock</td>
<td>( F = F_{\text{TARGET}} \leq F_{\text{MSY}} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( F \leq F_{\text{THRESHOLD}} )</td>
<td>Overfished, overfishing is not occurring; adopt and follow rebuilding plan</td>
<td>Not overfished, overfishing is not occurring; rebuild stock</td>
<td>( F = F_{\text{TARGET}} \leq F_{\text{MSY}} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fisheries management may take into account scientific and management uncertainty, and overfishing guidelines often include a control rule in the overfishing definition. Generically, the control rules suggest actions at various levels of stock biomass and incorporate an assessment of risk, in that \( F \) targets are set so as to avoid exceeding \( F \) thresholds.

**Outcome of Stock Assessment Review Meeting**


The Atlantic surfclam stock is neither overfished nor experiencing overfishing in 2011. The GBK component is nearly in an unfished condition. The surfclam fishery has been concentrated in relatively small areas for economic reasons. Much of the stock area has not been heavily fished. This explains the low overall \( F \) estimates, and is consistent with previous assessment results. Commercial LPUE trends show striking similarity to the declining surfclam stock trends estimated in the analytical assessment. Therefore, the SARC recommended that a more formal investigation of commercial LPUE for use in the assessment model be undertaken for future assessments. The assumed natural mortality rate \((M = 0.15)\) is uncertain and may overstate stock productivity. Further work on \( M \) is recommended to better understand stock vulnerability. A statistical catch-at-age and length model (SS3) replaced the biomass dynamic model (KLAMZ) used previously. Stock assessment results from the northern and southern areas were combined to evaluate the status of the stock for the entire EEZ. The SARC could not decide whether to recommend changing from the current single stock definition. The SARC noted that this should not prevent conducting stock assessments by subareas, nor should it preclude area-based management, if appropriate. Although absolute biomass is uncertain, trends in biomass are relatively certain. The ratio \( B_{2011} / B_{1999} \), where \( B_{1999} \) is a \( B_{\text{MSY}} \) proxy, is relatively stable because estimates of \( B_{2011} \) and \( B_{1999} \) generally vary together. Fishing mortality estimates are less robust because they compare the catch estimate against the less certain scale of biomass. This uncertainty is not considered to be a serious problem in relation to stock status because overall \( F \) is estimated to be well below \( F_{\text{THRESHOLD}} = M = 0.15 \).

The white hake stock is not overfished and overfishing is not occurring. This favorable determination of stock status is a change from the previous stock assessment in which white hake was judged to be overfished and subject to overfishing in 2007. Fishing mortality has varied over a wide range since the 1970s but presently is well below the \( F_{\text{MSY}} \) proxy. The improving condition of the stock is indicated by the more than three-fold increase in spawning stock biomass from a time series low in 1997. The estimated increase in spawning stock biomass from 2007 to 2011 was during a period when \( F \) was low and recruitment was near the long-term average. The 2013 SAW/SARC-56 white hake assessment model was a statistical catch-at-age model (ASAP) incorporating formulations that differed from the 2008 Statistical Catch-at-Age (SCAA) model. Results from the previous SCAA and new ASAP model formulations using revised data were similar in trend and magnitude. The improved stock status is not the result of changing assessment models. Recent recruitment was sampled when carrying out short term projections, while biological reference points (BRPs) were based on recruitment estimates from the entire time series. The SARC-56 Panel did not find a clear reason to derive BRPs based on the shorter, recent time series of recruitment. The SARC-56 Panel recommended that the \( F_{\text{MSY}} \) proxy of \( F_{40\%} \) currently in place should remain. This decision was based on consideration of the risks of depleting the stock associated with \( F_{40\%} \) and \( F_{35\%} \) as well as on the sensitivity of these risks to the assumed stock-recruitment steepness parameter.

SARC-56 concluded the Atlantic surfclam and white hake assessments were effective in delineating stock status, determining BRPs and proxies, and in projecting probable short-term trends in stock biomass, fishing mortality, and catches.
Glossary

ADAPT. A commonly used form of computer program used to optimally fit a Virtual Population Assessment (VPA) to abundance data.

ASAP. The Age Structured Assessment Program is an age-structured model that uses forward computations assuming separability of fishing mortality into year and age components to estimate population sizes given observed catches, catch-at-age, and indices of abundance. Discards can be treated explicitly. The separability assumption is relaxed by allowing for fleet-specific computations and by allowing the selectivity at age to change smoothly over time or in blocks of years. The software can also allow the catchability associated with each abundance index to vary smoothly with time. The problem’s dimensions (number of ages, years, fleets and abundance indices) are defined at input and limited by hardware only. The input is arranged assuming data is available for most years, but missing years are allowed. The model currently does not allow use of length data nor indices of survival rates. Diagnostics include index fits, residuals in catch and catch-at-age, and effective sample size calculations. Weights are input for different components of the objective function and allow for relatively simple age-structured production model type models up to fully parameterized models.

ASPM. Age-structured production models, also known as statistical catch-at-age (SCAA) models, are a technique of stock assessment that integrate fishery catch and fishery-independent sampling information. The procedures are flexible, allowing for uncertainty in the absolute magnitudes of catches as part of the estimation. Unlike virtual population analysis (VPA) that tracks the cumulative catches of various year classes as they age, ASPM is a forward projection simulation of the exploited population. ASPM is similar to the NOAA Fishery Toolbox applications ASAP (Age Structured Assessment Program) and SS2 (Stock Synthesis 2)

Availability. Refers to the distribution of fish of different ages or sizes relative to that taken in the fishery.

Biological reference points. Specific values for the variables that describe the state of a fishery system which are used to evaluate its status. Reference points are most often specified in terms of fishing mortality rate and/or spawning stock biomass. The reference points may indicate 1) a desired state of the fishery, such as a fishing mortality rate that will achieve a high level of sustainable yield, or 2) a state of the fishery that should be avoided, such as a high fishing mortality rate which risks a stock collapse and long-term loss of potential yield. The former type of reference points are referred to as “target reference points” and the latter are referred to as “limit reference points” or “thresholds”. Some common examples of reference points are F0.1, FMAX, and FMSY, which are defined later in this glossary.

B0. Virgin stock biomass, i.e., the long-term average biomass value expected in the absence of fishing mortality.

BMSY. Long-term average biomass that would be achieved if fishing at a constant fishing mortality rate equal to FMSY.

Biomass Dynamics Model. A simple stock assessment model that tracks changes in stock using assumptions about growth and can be tuned to abundance data such as commercial catch rates, research survey trends or biomass estimates.

Catchability. Proportion of the stock removed by one unit of effective fishing effort (typically age-specific due to
differences in selectivity and availability by age).

**Control Rule.** Describes a plan for pre-agreed management actions as a function of variables related to the status of the stock. For example, a control rule can specify how F or yield should vary with biomass. In the National Standard Guidelines (NSG), the “MSY control rule” is used to determine the limit fishing mortality, or Maximum Fishing Mortality Threshold (MFMT). Control rules are also known as “decision rules” or “harvest control laws.”

**Catch per Unit of Effort (CPUE).** Measures the relative success of fishing operations, but also can be used as a proxy for relative abundance based on the assumption that CPUE is linearly related to stock size. The use of CPUE that has not been properly standardized for temporal-spatial changes in catchability should be avoided.

**Exploitation pattern.** The fishing mortality on each age (or group of adjacent ages) of a stock relative to the highest mortality on any age. The exploitation pattern is expressed as a series of values ranging from 0.0 to 1.0. The pattern is referred to as “flat-topped” when the values for all the oldest ages are about 1.0, and “dome-shaped” when the values for some intermediate ages are about 1.0 and those for the oldest ages are significantly lower. This pattern often varies by type of fishing gear, area, and seasonal distribution of fishing, and the growth and migration of the fish. The pattern can be changed by modifications to fishing gear, for example, increasing mesh or hook size, or by changing the proportion of harvest by gear type.

**Mortality rates.** Populations of animals decline exponentially. This means that the number of animals that die in an "instant" is at all times proportional to the number present. The decline is defined by survival curves such as:  

\[ N_{t+1} = N_t e^{-Z} \]

where \( N_t \) is the number of animals in the population at time \( t \) and \( N_{t+1} \) is the number present in the next time period; \( Z \) is the total instantaneous mortality rate which can be separated into deaths due to fishing (fishing mortality or \( F \)) and deaths due to all other causes (natural mortality or \( M \)) and \( e \) is the base of the natural logarithm (2.71828).

To better understand the concept of an instantaneous mortality rate, consider the following example. Suppose the instantaneous total mortality rate is 2 (i.e., \( Z = 2 \)) and we want to know how many animals out of an initial population of 1 million fish will be alive at the end of one year. If the year is apportioned into 365 days (that is, the ‘instant’ of time is one day), then \( 2/365 \) or 0.548% of the population will die each day. On the first day of the year, 5,480 fish will die (1,000,000 x 0.00548), leaving 994,520 alive. On day 2, another 5,450 fish die (994,520 x 0.00548) leaving 989,070 alive. At the end of the year, 134,593 fish remain alive. If, we had instead selected a smaller 'instant' of time, say an hour, 0.0228% of the population would have died by the end of the first time interval (an hour), leaving 994,520 alive. On day 2, another 5,450 fish die (994,520 x 0.00548) leaving 989,070 alive. At the end of the year, 134,593 fish remain alive. If, we had instead selected a smaller 'instant' of time, say an hour, 0.0228% of the population would have died by the end of the first time interval (an hour), leaving 135,304 fish alive at the end of the year. As the instant of time becomes shorter and shorter, the exact answer to the number of animals surviving is given by the survival curve mentioned above, or, in this example:

\[ N_{t+1} = 1,000,000 e^{-2} = 135,335 \text{ fish} \]

**Exploitation rate.** The proportion of a population alive at the beginning of the year that is caught during the year. That is, if 1 million fish were alive on January 1 and 200,000 were caught during the year, the exploitation rate is 0.20 (200,000 / 1,000,000) or 20%.
**FMAX.** The rate of fishing mortality that produces the maximum level of yield per recruit. This is the point beyond which growth overfishing begins.

**F0.1.** The fishing mortality rate where the increase in yield per recruit for an increase in a unit of effort is only 10% of the yield per recruit produced by the first unit of effort on the unexploited stock (i.e., the slope of the yield-per-recruit curve for the F0.1 rate is only one-tenth the slope of the curve at its origin).

**F10%.** The fishing mortality rate which reduces the spawning stock biomass per recruit (SSB/R) to 10% of the amount present in the absence of fishing. More generally, Fx%, is the fishing mortality rate that reduces the SSB/R to x% of the level that would exist in the absence of fishing.

**FMSY.** The fishing mortality rate that produces the maximum sustainable yield.

**Fishery Management Plan (FMP).** Plan containing conservation and management measures for fishery resources, and other provisions required by the MSFCMA, developed by Fishery Management Councils or the Secretary of Commerce.

**Generation Time.** In the context of the National Standard Guidelines, generation time is a measure of the time required for a female to produce a reproductively-active female offspring for use in setting maximum allowable rebuilding time periods.

**Growth overfishing.** The situation existing when the rate of fishing mortality is above FMAX and when fish are harvested before they reach their growth potential.

**Limit Reference Points.** Benchmarks used to indicate when harvests should be constrained substantially so that the stock remains within safe biological limits. The probability of exceeding limits should be low. In the National Standard Guidelines, limits are referred to as thresholds. In much of the international literature (e.g., FAO documents), “thresholds” are used as buffer points that signal when a limit is being approached.

**Landings per Unit of Effort (LPUE).** Analogous to CPUE and measures the relative success of fishing operations, but is also sometimes used a proxy for relative abundance based on the assumption that CPUE is linearly related to stock size.


**Maximum Fishing Mortality Threshold (MFMT, F_THRESHOLD).** One of the Status Determination Criteria (SDC) for determining if overfishing is occurring. It will usually be equivalent to the F corresponding to the MSY Control Rule. If current fishing mortality rates are above F_THRESHOLD, overfishing is occurring.

**Minimum Stock Size Threshold (MSST, B_THRESHOLD).** Another of the Status Determination Criteria. The greater of (a) ½BMSY, or (b) the minimum stock size at which rebuilding to BMSY will occur within 10 years of fishing at the MFMT. MSST should be measured in terms of spawning biomass or other appropriate measures of productive capacity. If current stock size is below B_THRESHOLD, the stock is overfished.

**Maximum Spawning Potential (MSP).** This type of reference point is used in some fishery management plans to define overfishing. The MSP is the spawning stock biomass per recruit (SSB/R) when fishing mortality is zero. The degree to which fishing reduces the SSB/R is expressed as a percentage of the MSP (i.e., %MSP). A stock is considered overfished when the
fishery reduces the %MSP below the level specified in the overfishing definition. The values of %MSP used to define overfishing can be derived from stock-recruitment data or chosen by analogy using available information on the level required to sustain the stock.

**Maximum Sustainable Yield (MSY).** The largest average catch that can be taken from a stock under existing environmental conditions.

**Overfishing.** According to the National Standard Guidelines, “overfishing occurs whenever a stock or stock complex is subjected to a rate or level of fishing mortality that jeopardizes the capacity of a stock or stock complex to produce MSY on a continuing basis.” Overfishing is occurring if the MFMT is exceeded for 1 year or more.

**Optimum Yield (OY).** The amount of fish that will provide the greatest overall benefit to the Nation, particularly with respect to food production and recreational opportunities and taking into account the protection of marine ecosystems. MSY constitutes a “ceiling” for OY. OY may be lower than MSY, depending on relevant economic, social, or ecological factors. In the case of an overfished fishery, OY should provide for rebuilding to B<sub>MSY</sub>.

**Partial Recruitment.** Patterns of relative vulnerability of fish of different sizes or ages due to the combined effects of selectivity and availability.

**Rebuilding Plan.** A plan that must be designed to recover stocks to the B<sub>MSY</sub> level within 10 years when they are overfished (i.e. when B < MSST). Normally, the 10 years would refer to an expected time to rebuilding in a probabilistic sense.

**Recruitment.** This is the number of young fish that survive (from birth) to a specific age or grow to a specific size. The specific age or size at which recruitment is measured may correspond to when the young fish become vulnerable to capture in a fishery or when the number of fish in a cohort can be reliably estimated by a stock assessment.

**Recruitment overfishing.** The situation existing when the fishing mortality rate is so high as to cause a reduction in spawning stock which causes recruitment to become impaired.

**Recruitment per spawning stock biomass (R/SSB).** The number of fishery recruits (usually age 1 or 2) produced from a given weight of spawners, usually expressed as numbers of recruits per kilogram of mature fish in the stock. This ratio can be computed for each year class and is often used as an index of pre-recruit survival, since a high R/SSB ratio in one year indicates above-average numbers resulting from a given spawning biomass for a particular year class, and vice versa.

**Reference Points.** Values of parameters (e.g. B<sub>MSY</sub>, F<sub>MSY</sub>, F<sub>0.1</sub>) that are useful benchmarks for guiding management decisions. Biological reference points are typically limits that should not be exceeded with significant probability (e.g., MSST) or targets for management (e.g., OY).

**Risk.** The probability of an event times the cost associated with the event (loss function). Sometimes “risk” is simply used to denote the probability of an undesirable result (e.g. the risk of biomass falling below MSST).

**Status Determination Criteria (SDC).** Objective and measurable criteria used to determine if a stock is being overfished or is in an overfished state according to the National Standard Guidelines.

**Selectivity.** Measures the relative vulnerability of different age (size) classes to the fishing gears(s).
Spawning Stock Biomass (SSB). The total weight of all sexually mature fish in a stock.

Spawning stock biomass per recruit (SSB/R or SBR). The expected lifetime contribution to the spawning stock biomass for each recruit. SSB/R is calculated assuming that F is constant over the life span of a year class. The calculated value is also dependent on the exploitation pattern and rates of growth and natural mortality, all of which are also assumed to be constant.

Stock Synthesis (SS). A stock assessment model that can be fit to many different types of data including catches, discards, survey trends, and age and size composition data from fisheries or surveys. Multiple subareas with different population dynamics can be modeled simultaneously. The structure of SS allows for building of simple to complex models depending upon the data available. Stock Synthesis is a forward projecting model like ASAP but substantially more flexible.

Survival Ratios. Ratios of recruits to spawners (or spawning biomass) in a stock-recruitment analysis. The same as the recruitment per spawning stock biomass (R/SSB), see above.

TAC. Total allowable catch is the total regulated catch from a stock in a given time period, usually a year.

Target Reference Points. Benchmarks used to guide management objectives for achieving a desirable outcome (e.g., OY). Target reference points should not be exceeded on average.

Uncertainty. Uncertainty results from a lack of perfect knowledge of many factors that affect stock assessments, estimation of reference points, and management. Rosenberg and Restrepo (1994) identify 5 types: measurement error (in observed quantities), process error (or natural population variability), model error (mis-specification of assumed values or model structure), estimation error (in population parameters or reference points, due to any of the preceding types of errors), and implementation error (or the inability to achieve targets exactly for whatever reason)

Virtual population analysis (VPA) (or cohort analysis). A retrospective analysis of the catches from a given year class which provides estimates of fishing mortality and stock size at each age over its life in the fishery. This technique is used extensively in fishery assessments.

Year class (or cohort). Fish born in a given year. For example, the 1987 year class of cod includes all cod born in 1987. This year class would be age 1 in 1988, age 2 in 1989, and so on.

Yield per recruit (Y/R or YPR). The average expected yield in weight from a single recruit. Y/R is calculated assuming that F is constant over the life span of a year class. The calculated value is also dependent on the exploitation pattern, rate of growth, and natural mortality rate, all of which are assumed to be constant.
Figure 1. Offshore depth strata sampled during Northeast Fisheries Science Center bottom trawl research surveys. Some of these may not be sampled presently.
Figure 2. Inshore depth strata sampled during Northeast Fisheries Science Center bottom trawl research surveys. Some of these may not be sampled presently.
Figure 3. Statistical areas used for reporting commercial catches.
Figure 4. Northeast Fisheries Science Center clam resource survey strata, along the east coast of the US.